

May 14, 2009

Mr. John T. Carlin  
Vice President, R.E. Ginna Nuclear Power Plant  
R.E. Ginna Nuclear Power Plant, LLC  
1503 Lake Road  
Ontario, New York 14519

SUBJECT: R.E. GINNA NUCLEAR POWER PLANT – NRC EVALUATED EMERGENCY  
PREPAREDNESS EXERCISE – INSPECTION REPORT NO.  
05000244/2009502

Dear Mr. Carlin:

On May 8, 2009, the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) completed an inspection of the May 5, 2009, evaluated emergency preparedness exercise at your R.E. Ginna Nuclear Power Plant. The enclosed inspection report documents the inspection results, which were discussed on May 8, 2009, with Mr. David Holm and other members of your staff.

The inspection examined activities conducted under your license as they relate to safety and compliance with the Commission's rules and regulations and with the conditions of your license. The inspectors reviewed selected procedures and records, observed activities, and interviewed personnel.

Based on the results of this inspection, no findings of significance were identified.

In accordance with 10 CFR 2.390 of the NRC's "Rules of Practice," a copy of this letter and its enclosure and your response (if any) will be available electronically for public inspection in the NRC Public Document Room or from the Publicly Available Records (PARS) component of the NRC's document system (ADAMS). ADAMS is accessible from the NRC Web site at <http://www.nrc.gov/reading-rm/adams.html> (the Public Electronic Reading Room).

Sincerely,

/RA/

James A. Trapp, Chief  
Plant Support Branch 1  
Division of Reactor Safety

Docket No. 50-244  
License No. DPR-18

Enclosure: NRC Inspection Report 05000244/2009502

Mr. John T. Carlin  
Vice President, R.E. Ginna Nuclear Power Plant  
R.E. Ginna Nuclear Power Plant, LLC  
1503 Lake Road  
Ontario, New York 14519

SUBJECT: R.E. GINNA NUCLEAR POWER PLANT – NRC EVALUATED EMERGENCY  
PREPAREDNESS EXERCISE – INSPECTION REPORT NO. 05000244/2009502

Dear Mr. Carlin:

On May 8, 2009, the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) completed an inspection of the May 5, 2009, evaluated emergency preparedness exercise at your R.E. Ginna Nuclear Power Plant. The enclosed inspection report documents the inspection results, which were discussed on May 8, 2009, with Mr. David Holm and other members of your staff.

The inspection examined activities conducted under your license as they relate to safety and compliance with the Commission's rules and regulations and with the conditions of your license. The inspectors reviewed selected procedures and records, observed activities, and interviewed personnel.

Based on the results of this inspection, no findings of significance were identified.

In accordance with 10 CFR 2.390 of the NRC's "Rules of Practice," a copy of this letter and its enclosure and your response (if any) will be available electronically for public inspection in the NRC Public Document Room or from the Publicly Available Records (PARS) component of the NRC's document system (ADAMS). ADAMS is accessible from the NRC Web site at <http://www.nrc.gov/reading-rm/adams.html> (the Public Electronic Reading Room).

Sincerely,

James A. Trapp, Chief  
Plant Support Branch 1  
Division of Reactor Safety

Docket No. 50-244  
License No. DPR-18

Enclosure: NRC Inspection Report 05000244/2009502

**SUNSI Review Complete: JMT (Reviewer's Initials)** **ML#091340610**

**Non-Public Designation Category: MD 3.4 Non-Public (A.3 - A.7 or B.1)**

**DOCUMENT NAME: G:\DRS\Plant Support Branch 1\BARR\EP Ex09 Ginna\Ginna EP EX 2009 Report.doc**

After declaring this document "An Official Agency Record" it will be released to the Public.

**To receive a copy of this document, indicate in the box: "C" = Copy without attachment/enclosure "E" = Copy with attachment/enclosure "N" = No copy**

OFFICE	RI/DRS	RI/DRP	RI/DRS				
NAME	STBarr/	GDentel/	JTrapp/				
DATE	5/14/09	5 5/14/09	5/14/09				

OFFICIAL RECORD COPY

cc w/encl:

M. J. Wallace, Vice - President, Constellation Energy  
B. Barron, President, CEO & Chief Nuclear Officer, Constellation Energy Nuclear Group, LLC  
P. Eddy, Electric Division, NYS Department of Public Service  
C. Donaldson, Esquire, Assistant Attorney General, New York Department of Law  
C. Fleming, Esquire, Senior Counsel, Nuclear Generation, Constellation Nuclear Energy  
Nuclear Group, LLC  
T. Harding, Acting Director, Licensing, Constellation Energy Nuclear Group, LLC  
A. Peterson, SLO Designee, New York State Energy Research and Development Authority  
F. Murray, President & CEO, New York State Energy Research and Development Authority  
G. Bastedo, Director, Wayne County Emergency Management Office  
M. Meisenzahl, Administrator, Monroe County, Office of Emergency Management  
T. Judson, Central New York Citizens Awareness Network  
R. Thompson, RAC Chair, FEMA Region II

Distribution w/encl: (via E-mail)

S. Collins, RA

M. Dapas, DRA

D. Lew, DRP

J. Clifford, DRP

Stephen Campbell, RI OEDO

R. Nelson, NRR

D. V. Pickett, PM, NRR

B. Vaidya, PM, NRR

G. Dentel, DRP

N. Perry, DRP

J. Hawkins, DRP

K. Kolaczyk, DRP, SRI

M. Rose, DRP, Resident OA

R. Kahler, NSIR/EPD

S. LaVie, NSIR/EPD

[ROPreports@nrc.gov](mailto:ROPreports@nrc.gov)

Region I Docket Room (with concurrences)

D. Roberts, DRS

J. Trapp, DRS

U.S. NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

REGION I

Docket No.: 05000244

License No.: DPR-18

Report No.: 05000244/2009502

Licensee: R.E. Ginna Nuclear Power Plant, LLC

Facility: R.E. Ginna Nuclear Power Plant

Location: Ontario, New York

Dates: May 4-8, 2009

Inspectors: S. Barr, Sr. Emergency Preparedness Inspector, DRS, Region I (Lead)  
S. LaVie, Senior Emergency Preparedness Specialist, Nuclear Security and  
Incident Response (NSIR)  
K. Kolaczyk, Senior Resident Inspector – Ginna, DRP, Region I  
D. Silk, Senior Operations Inspector, DRS, Region I  
E. Schrader, Emergency Preparedness Specialist, NSIR (Training)  
S. Ibarrola, Reactor Engineer, DRP, Region I

Approved By: James A. Trapp, Chief  
Plant Support Branch 1  
Division of Reactor Safety

## **SUMMARY OF FINDINGS**

IR 05000244/2009502; 05/4-8/2009; R.E. Ginna Nuclear Power Plant; Exercise Evaluation; Emergency Action Level and Emergency Plan Changes; Emergency Preparedness Performance Indicators.

This was an announced inspection conducted by four region-based inspectors and two headquarters-based inspectors. No findings of significance were identified. The NRC's program for overseeing the safe operation of commercial nuclear power reactors is described in NUREG-1649, "Reactor Oversight Process," Revision 4, dated December 2006.

### **Cornerstone: Emergency Preparedness**

A. NRC-Identified and Self-Revealing Findings

No findings of significance were identified.

B. Licensee-Identified Findings

None.

## REPORT DETAILS

### 1. REACTOR SAFETY

Cornerstone: Emergency Preparedness (EP)

1EP1 Exercise Evaluation (71114.01 – 1 Sample)

a. Inspection Scope

Prior to the May 5, 2009, emergency preparedness exercise, the NRC inspectors conducted an in-office review of the exercise objectives and scenario, which Constellation had submitted to the NRC, to determine if the exercise would test major elements of the Ginna Emergency Plan as required by 10 CFR 50.47(b)(14). This overall exercise inspection activity represented the completion of one sample on a biennial cycle.

The exercise evaluation consisted of the following review and assessment:

- The adequacy of Constellation's performance in the biennial full-participation exercise regarding the implementation of the risk-significant planning standards (RSPS) described in 10 CFR 50.47(b)(4), (5), (9), and (10), which are: emergency classification; offsite notification; radiological assessment; and protective action recommendations, respectively.
- The overall adequacy of Constellation's Ginna emergency response facilities with regard to NUREG-0696, "Functional Criteria for Emergency Response Facilities," and Emergency Plan commitments. The facilities assessed were the Control Room Simulator, Operations Support Center (OSC), Technical Support Center (TSC), Emergency Operations Facility (EOF), and Joint Information Center (JIC).
- A review of other performance areas, such as: the Ginna emergency response organization's (ERO's) recognition of abnormal plant conditions; command and control; intra- and inter-facility communications; prioritization of mitigating activities; utilization of repair and field monitoring teams; interface with offsite agencies; staffing and procedure adequacy; and the overall implementation of the emergency plan and its implementing procedures.
- A review of past performance issues from the last NRC Ginna exercise inspection report and Constellation's Ginna EP drill reports, to determine the effectiveness of licensee corrective actions as demonstrated during the May 5, 2009, exercise and to ensure compliance with 10 CFR 50.47(b)(14).
- The licensee's post-exercise critiques, to evaluate Constellation's self-assessment of its ERO performance during the May 5, 2009, exercise and to ensure compliance with 10 CFR 50, Appendix E, Section IV.F.2.g.

The inspectors reviewed the documents listed in the attachment to this report.

b. Findings

No findings of significance were identified.

1EP4 Emergency Action Level (EAL) and Emergency Plan Changes (71114.04 – 1 Sample)

a. Inspection Scope

Since the last NRC inspection of this program area, Constellation implemented Revision 28 of the Ginna Station Nuclear Emergency Response Plan. Constellation had determined that, in accordance with 10 CFR 50.54(q), any change made to the Plan had not resulted in any decrease in effectiveness of the Plan, and that the revised Plan continued to meet the requirements of 10 CFR 50.47(b) and Appendix E to 10 CFR 50. The inspectors reviewed all EAL changes made since June 2008, and conducted a sampling review of other Emergency Plan changes, including changes to lower-tier emergency plan implementing procedures, to evaluate for any potential decreases in effectiveness of the Emergency Plan. However, this review was not documented in an NRC Safety Evaluation Report and does not constitute formal NRC approval of the changes. Therefore, these changes remain subject to future NRC inspection in their entirety.

b. Findings

No findings of significance were identified.

4. **OTHER ACTIVITIES (OA)**

4OA1 Performance Indicator (PI) Verification (71151 – 3 Samples)

a. Inspection Scope

The inspectors reviewed data for the Ginna EP PIs, which are: (1) Drill and Exercise Performance (DEP); (2) Emergency Response Organization (ERO) Drill Participation; and, (3) Alert and Notification System (ANS) Reliability. The last NRC EP inspection at Ginna was conducted in the second quarter of 2008, so the inspectors reviewed supporting documentation from EP drills, training records, and equipment tests from the second calendar quarter of 2008 through the first quarter of 2009, to verify the accuracy of the reported PI data. The review of these PIs was conducted in accordance with NRC Inspection Procedure 71151, using the acceptance criteria documented in NEI 99-02, "Regulatory Assessment Performance Indicator Guidelines," Revision 5.

Additionally, the inspector performed NRC Temporary Instruction (TI) 2515/175, ensured the completeness of the licensee's completed Attachment 1 from the TI, and forwarded that data to NRC Headquarters.

This inspection activity represented the completion of three samples on an annual cycle.

b. Findings

No findings of significance were identified.

4OA6 Meetings, Including Exit

On May 8, 2009, the inspectors presented the results of this inspection to Mr. D. Holm, the Plant General Manager, and other members of the Constellation staff. No proprietary information was provided to the inspectors during this inspection.

**ATTACHMENT**

**SUPPLEMENTAL INFORMATION**

**KEY POINTS OF CONTACT**

**Licensee Personnel**

D. Holm, Plant General Manager  
J. Jones, Director – Emergency Planning, Constellation Energy  
A. Hedges, Director - Emergency Planning, Ginna

**LIST OF ITEMS OPENED, CLOSED, AND DISCUSSED**

None

**LIST OF DOCUMENTS REVIEWED**

**Section 1EP1: Exercise Evaluation**

Ginna Station Nuclear Emergency Response Plan, Revision 02800  
Ginna Emergency Plan Implementing Procedures  
Ginna May 5, 2009, Emergency Exercise Scenario Package  
Ginna Emergency Preparedness Drill Reports, January 2008 – April 2009  
Condition Reports generated as a result of the May 5, 2009, exercise  
(As documented in Ginna Emergency Preparedness Drill Report GNP-EP-DR-09-02)

**Section 1EP4: Emergency Action Level and Emergency Plan Changes**

Ginna Station Nuclear Emergency Response Plan, Revision 02800  
CNG-OP-1.01-1004, Plant Operations Review Committee (PORC)/Qualified Reviewer (QR),  
Revision 00001  
CNG-PR-1.01-1000, Fleet Procedure Process, Revision 00400  
A-205.2, Emergency Plan Implementing Procedures, Revision 02500  
Various Emergency Plan and related procedure and equipment 10CFR50.54(q) screenings and  
evaluations, dated between June 2008 and April 2009

**Section 4OA1: Performance Indicator Verification**

IP-EPP-9, Emergency Response Organization Performance Indicators, Revision 00000  
ERO Drill Participation PI data, April 2008 – March 2009  
Alert Notification System PI data, April 2008 – March 2009  
DEP PI data, April 2008 – March 2009

**A-2**  
**LIST OF ACRONYMS**

ANS	Alert Notification System
CR	Condition Report
DEP	Drill and Exercise Performance
EAL	Emergency Action Level
EOF	Emergency Operations Facility
EP	Emergency Preparedness
ERO	Emergency Response Organization
JIC	Joint Information Center
NEI	Nuclear Energy Institute
NRC	Nuclear Regulatory Commission
OSC	Operations Support Center
PI	Performance Indicator
RSPS	Risk Significant Planning Standard
TSC	Technical Support Center